Journal of Experimental Botany, Page 1 of 12 doi:10.1093/jxb/erm328



SPECIAL ISSUE REVIEW PAPER Photosynthetic symbioses in animals

A.A. Venn^{1,*}, J.E. Loram^{1,*} and A.E. Douglas^{2,†}

¹ Bermuda Institute of Ocean Sciences, Ferry Reach, St Georges GE01, Bermuda

² Department of Biology, University of York, PO Box 373, York YO10 5YW, UK

Received 1 May 2007; Revised 24 October 2007; Accepted 29 October 2007

Abstract

Animals acquire photosynthetically-fixed carbon by forming symbioses with algae and cyanobacteria. These associations are widespread in the phyla Porifera (sponges) and Cnidaria (corals, sea anemones etc.) but otherwise uncommon or absent from animal phyla. It is suggested that one factor contributing to the distribution of animal symbioses is the morphologically-simple body plan of the Porifera and Cnidaria with a large surface area:volume relationship wellsuited to light capture by symbiotic algae in their tissues. Photosynthetic products are released from living symbiont cells to the animal host at substantial rates. Research with algal cells freshly isolated from the symbioses suggests that low molecular weight compounds (e.g. maltose, glycerol) are the major release products but further research is required to assess the relevance of these results to the algae in the intact symbiosis. Photosynthesis also poses risks for the animal because environmental perturbations, especially elevated temperature or irradiance, can lead to the production of reactive oxygen species, damage to membranes and proteins, and 'bleaching', including breakdown of the symbiosis. The contribution of nonphotochemical guenching and membrane lipid composition of the algae to bleaching susceptibility is assessed. More generally, the development of genomic techniques to help understand the processes underlying the function and breakdown of function in photosynthetic symbioses is advocated.

Key words: Bleaching, *Chlorella*, Cnidaria, coral, metabolite profiling, nutrient release, photosynthesis, *Symbiodinium*, symbiosis, symbiotic algae.

Introduction

Oxygenic photosynthesis has apparently evolved just once, in the lineage that gave rise to all extant cyanobacteria (Cavalier-Smith, 2006). This metabolic capability has, however, been acquired on multiple occasions by eukaryotes through symbiosis either with cyanobacteria or with their unicellular eukaryotic derivatives generically termed 'algae'. Overall, 27 (49%) of the 55 eukaryotic groups identified by Baldauf (2003) have representatives which possess photosynthetic symbionts or their derivatives, the plastids. These include the three major groups of multicellular eukaryotes: the plants, which are derivatives of the most ancient symbiosis between eukaryotes and cyanobacteria; the fungi, many of which are lichenized with algae or cyanobacteria; and the animals. We, the authors, and probably many readers were taught that animals do not photosynthesize. This statement is true in the sense that the lineage giving rise to animals did not possess plastids, but false in the wider sense: many animals photosynthesize through symbiosis with algae or cyanobacteria.

This article on 'photosynthesis in animals' focuses on the central role of photosynthesis in symbioses between algae and animals, by considering three topics: the importance of light capture as a factor limiting the distribution of the symbioses in the animal kingdom; photosynthate transfer to the animal host, especially the underlying mechanisms and significance to the animal host; and risks to the symbiosis posed by photosynthetic reactions in the plastids of symbiotic algae. Two issues are beyond the scope of this article. These are the transient animal associations with photosynthetically-active chloroplasts obtained from algae consumed by the animal, and the significance of symbiotic algae to the animal host beyond the nutritional role of photosynthesis. In particular, some algal symbionts contribute to the nitrogen

© The Author [2008]. Published by Oxford University Press [on behalf of the Society for Experimental Biology]. All rights reserved. For Permissions, please e-mail: journals.permissions@oxfordjournals.org

^{*} These authors contributed equally to this publication.

[†] To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: aed2@york.ac.uk

2 of 12 Venn et al.

relations of their hosts by acting as a sink for animal metabolic waste, especially ammonia. Furthermore, the algae may recycle nitrogen, i.e. assimilate ammonia into compounds valuable to the host, such as essential amino acids, which are released to the host. Early approaches to explore nitrogen recycling were experimentally flawed (see the discussion in Wang and Douglas, 1998), but recent approaches exploiting stable isotope techniques are yielding firm indications of nitrogen recycling in some symbioses (Tanaka *et al.*, 2006).

Distribution of photosynthetic symbioses in animals

Most animals with photosynthetic symbioses are members of two phyla, the Porifera (the sponges) and Cnidaria (including the hydroids, corals, sea anemones, and jellyfish) (Table 1). The dominant algal symbionts in these animals are freshwater chlorophytes of the genus *Chlorella* found, for example, in *Spongilla* sponges and freshwater hydras; dinoflagellates of the genus *Symbiodinium* in benthic marine hosts, including virtually all reefbuilding corals in the photic zone; and cyanobacteria in many marine sponges. These two animal phyla are morphologically simple and traditionally considered as the basal animal groups.

Animal body plan may contribute to the distribution of photosynthetic symbioses in animals. The body plans of both Porifera and Cnidaria inherently have a large surface area:volume relationship promoting the capture of light to meet the demands of the bulk tissue for photosynthetically-derived carbon. In particular, the Cnidaria are diploblast animals, comprising just two sheets of cells (the outer epidermis and inner gastrodermis) and can be moulded, through natural selection, into a variety of shapes; in his book on sea anemones, Malcolm Shick (1991) aptly terms these animals 'origami animals'. All other animals have the triploblast body plan, i.e. with a third body layer derived from the embryonic mesoderm. The triploblast body plan is 'solid', generally of low surface area per unit volume, and with limited capacity for extensive evaginations suitable for the absorption of light. Consistent with this distinction, photosynthetic symbioses in triploblastic animals is largely restricted to flatworms (turbellarian platyhelminths) constrained, despite their possession of mesoderm, to a large surface area:volume relationship by their lack of circulatory system (Table 1).

Photosynthetic symbioses do, however, occur in a few molluscs, which are large and morphologically complex animals; and molluscan hosts display considerable morphological adaptation for the symbiotic habit, an indication that the basic body form is not well-suited to photosynthesis. The tridacnid molluscs (family Tridacnidae: giant clams) are particularly informative. This group comprises five species, including Tridacnis gigas of up to 180 kg weight, and they all bear photosynthetic algal symbionts of the dinoflagellate genus Symbiodinium. The tridacnids differ from other bivalve molluscs in that the body is rotated through 180° relative to the hinge, and the siphonal tissue is hypertrophied, such that the 'gape' of the shell reveals the siphonal tissue and mantle of the animal, and not the foot as in other bivalves. Accompanying this radical re-organization of the body plan to accommodate photosynthesis, the digestive tract is transformed into multiple dichotomously branching diverticula bearing Symbiodinium cells and projecting towards the light—like branches of a tree (Norton et al., 1992). These remarkable morphological adaptations are a consequence of the poor compatibility of photosynthesis and the massive body form characteristic of most triploblastic animals.

These considerations should not, however, be interpreted to mean that photosynthesis poses no morphological conflict for the diploblast Cnidaria. The morphological conflict for Cnidaria is particularly evident in relation to the animals' tentacles, especially of sea anemones and their allies. Most Cnidaria with symbiotic algae are also carnivores, and in most species prey items

Table 1. Survey of symbioses between animals and photosynthetic symbionts

Hosts	Symbionts	References Lee <i>et al.</i> , 2001	
Porifera	Cyanobacteria in many marine sponges,		
	Symbiodinium in clionid (boring) marine sponges,		
	Chlorella in freshwater sponges, e.g. Spongilla		
Cnidaria	Symbiodinium in benthic marine corals, sea anemones etc.	Stat et al., 2006	
	Scripsiella spp. in pelagic taxa, e.g. Velella	Banaszak et al., 1993	
	Chlorella in freshwater hydra		
Platyhelminthes	Various in marine turbellarians, e.g. <i>Tetraselmis</i> (prasinophyte)	Parke and Manton, 1967	
	in Symsagittifera (=Convoluta) roscoffensis;	Apelt and Ax, 1969	
	Licmophora (diatom) in Convoluta convoluta	Douglas, 1987	
	Chlorella in freshwater turbellarians, e.g. Dalyella spp		
Mollusca	Dinoflagellates, usually Symbiodinium in marine gastropods and	Belda-Baillie et al., 2002	
	bivalves, including tridacnid clams; Chlorella in few freshwater		
	clams, e.g. Anodonta		
Ascidia	Cyanobacteria, usually Prochloron in various ascidians	Lewin and Chang, 1989	

are trapped by nematocysts on the animals' tentacles. (Nematocysts are organelles which subdue prey by their toxic barbs and adhesive secretions prior to ingestion.) Food capture is promoted by the possession of relatively few, long, mobile tentacles with a high density of nematocysts; and photosynthesis is promoted by large numbers of short tentacles with high densities of symbiotic algal cells. Most of the Cnidaria which obtain nutrition by a combination of feeding and photosynthesis display morphological 'compromise' in relation to their tentacles. The several exceptions are informative.

The remarkable sea anemone *Lebrunia danae* has dimorphic tentacles. One form of its tentacles lacks symbiotic algae and is long and slender, suited for feeding; and the other form is short but branched and densely colonized by *Symbiodinium* (Fig. 1A). Interference between the two tentacle types is avoided in the living animal by specific extension of the feeding tentacles at night, when food is available in the water column, and photosynthetic tentacles by day, for light capture. The morphology of the two tentacles is so different that

L. danae was originally classified as a member of two different genera.

Other sea anemones have resolved the conflict by the evolution of novel structures for either feeding or photosynthesis. In Bunodeopsis species, the tentacles are predominantly feeding structures and the Symbiodinium algae are concentrated in vesicles on the body column (Fig. 1B). By day, the vesicles inflate by the accumulation of sea water, so maximizing the surface area for light capture, with the tentacles retracted; and the reverse occurs at night (Day, 1994). Discosoma species adopt a different morphological strategy (Fig. 1C). These coralliomorph cnidarians have small, 'stubby' tentacles almost entirely devoid of nematocysts, and food capture is mediated by the lateral expansion of the oral disc (the upper surface of the body column bearing the mouth and tentacles) to form a muscular 'oral veil'. When prey make contact with the oral disc, the oral veil extends rapidly upand-over the prey, which is essential 'bagged' before transfer whole via the mouth to the gut (Elliott and Cook, 1989).



Fig. 1. Morphological adaptations for light capture in sea anemones with photosynthetic symbionts. Scale bars=2.5 cm. (a) Dimorphic tentacles of *Lebrunia danae* (i) photosynthetic tentacles and (ii) colourless feeding tentacles emerging in response to a prey item. (b) Vesicles on the body wall of *Bunodeopsis antilliensis* bearing symbiotic algal cells: at night, when feeding tentacles are extended; and by day when the feeding tentacles are retracted and the vesicles expanded. (Photographs of R Day.) (c) Tentacles on the oral disc of *Discosoma sanctithome* (i), and capture of small fish prey by extension of the oral veil (2–4, see text for details). (Photographs of B Watson.)

These various morphological adaptations are indicative of the selective advantage of symbiosis with algae for their animal hosts. A key basis of this selective advantage is host access to alga-derived photosynthetic carbon, which is considered in the next section.

Host access to photosynthetic carbon fixed by symbiotic algae

Algal cells in symbiosis with animals are photosynthetically competent, fixing carbon dioxide and releasing oxygen at rates (per cell or per unit chlorophyll) at least comparable to algal cells in culture. In most animal hosts, the algal cells are intracellular, bounded by an animal membrane, known as the symbiosomal membrane. As a result, they obtain the carbon dioxide and water for the photosynthetic reaction and all substrates required for synthesis of cellular constituents, including the photosynthetic apparatus, from the host cell. Delivery of substrates has involved biochemical and cellular adaptation by the animal. In particular, marine cnidarians bearing Symbiodinium, first, maintain high activity of carbonic anhydrase and, second, have specific transporters for the delivery of bicarbonate ions to the cells bearing the symbiotic algae. These traits provide a partial pressure of CO_2 in the immediate surroundings of the symbiont cells that is high enough to support photosynthetic carbon fixation (Allemand et al., 1998).

Radiotracer experiments with ¹⁴C-bicarbonate demonstrate that the algae release up to 50% of photosynthetically-fixed carbon to the animal host; and these values may be underestimates because of incomplete penetration of ¹⁴C-radioisotope in short-term experiments, and respiratory loss of radioactivity from the animal as CO_2 which is refixed by the algal cells. Photosynthate release is biotrophic (i.e. from living cells) and apparently selective, with the dominant photosynthetic products of the algal cells apparently 'protected' from release.

Much research has focused on the identity of the compounds translocated to the animal tissues; these compounds are known as 'mobile' compounds (Table 2). There has been a strong expectation that the mobile compounds are dominated by one (or a few) compounds of low molecular weight, by analogy with the release of triose phosphate from chloroplasts and single polyols from the algal symbionts in lichens. Early research on the symbiotic Chlorella in freshwater hydra appeared to confirm this expectation. When the Chlorella cells are isolated from hydra and incubated immediately in simple buffer of pH 4-5 under illumination, they release large amounts of the disaccharide maltose. Metabolic analyses revealed that the maltose is synthesized within 1 min of carbon fixation and derived from a small metabolic pool with high turnover (Cernichiari et al., 1969). It was concluded, entirely plausibly, that maltose is the mobile compound of symbiotic *Chlorella*. Consistent with this interpretation, non-symbiotic *Chlorella* do not release photosynthate in response to low pH. Doubt over the relevance of this research with freshly-isolated *Chlorella* has been cast subsequently, with the demonstration that the pH in the immediate environment of *Chlorella* in the symbiosomal space in the symbiosis is >5.5, and would not be expected to induce substantial maltose release (Rands *et al.*, 1992).

Studies seeking to identify the processes mediating photosynthate release and the identity of the mobile compounds in symbioses with Symbiodinium has also focused on algal cells freshly-isolated from the symbiosis. Photosynthate release from isolated Symbiodinium cells is not triggered by manipulation of pH of the medium, but it is induced by the addition of 'a drop of' homogenate of the host tissues (Trench, 1971). The active component in the host homogenate has variously been identified as proteinaceous (Sutton and Hoegh-Guldberg, 1990) and amino acids, including high concentrations of protein amino acids (Gates et al., 1995) and micro-molar concentrations of the non-protein amino acid, taurine (Wang and Douglas, 1997), but its identity remains elusive. Its mode of action involves modification of algal metabolism (Grant et al., 2006), and it can be mimicked by clotrimazole $(1-\alpha-2$ chlorotrityl imidazole) (Ritchie *et al.*, 1997), raising the possibility that the host factor is an antagonist of calmodulin and may modulate Ca2+-calmodulinmediated signalling in either the animal or algal cell.

Symbiodinium cells incubated with host homogenate release various low molecular weight compounds derived from photosynthesis, including glycerol, organic acids, glucose, and amino acids, the composition and diversity of released compounds varying among different symbioses and studies (Trench, 1979). The factors contributing to this variation may include homogenate composition, genotype, and metabolic condition of Symbiodinium and the protocol used for separation and identification of released compounds. These uncertainties notwithstanding, these data suggest that the mobile compounds of Symbio*dinium* are not derived directly from a single metabolic pool in the alga. In other words, photosynthate release from Symbiodinium is likely to be more complex metabolically than from the plastids of plants and symbiotic Chlorella.

Just as with the *Chlorella* system, there is doubt over the relevance of the traits of isolated *Symbiodinium* to the intact symbiosis. Perhaps the most telling study was conducted by Ishikura *et al.* (1999) on *Symbiodinium* in the giant clam *Tridacna crocea*. Unlike the symbioses in corals and other Cnidaria, *Symbiodinium* is extracellular in tridacnids, making direct analysis of the photosynthetic compounds released from the algae in symbiosis technically feasible. Ishikura *et al.* (1999) demonstrated that the dominant compound released by the algae in *T. crocea* is

Host		Symbiont	Experimental Technique	Mobile Compounds	References
Porifera	Marine Fresh water	Cyanobacteria Chlorella sp.	¹⁴ C tracer experiments: isolated algae ¹⁴ C tracer experiments: isolated algae with comparison to metabolism of ¹⁴ C-	Glycerol and a small organic Glucose	Wilkinson, 1979 Wilkinson, 1980
Cridaria	Coral	Symbiodinium	¹⁴ C tracer experiments: isolated algae ¹⁴ C tracer experiments: freshly isolated algae with or without host homogenate.	Glucose glycerol, sugars, organic acids and amino acids	Fischer <i>et al.</i> , 1989 Muscatine, 1967; Sutton and Hoegh Guldberg, 1990; Gates <i>et al.</i> , 1995, Grant <i>et al.</i> , 1997 Hinde, 1988, Lewis and Smith, 1971
			Measurement of respiratory quotients	Glycerol in shallow colonies ($\leq 5m$) and lipid in deeper colonies (30 m)	Gattuso and Jaubert, 1990
			Identification of dinoflagellate (algal)-	Polyunsaturated fatty acids	Papina et al., 2003
			14 C tracer experiments with NaH ¹⁴ CO ₂ and 14 C acetate: intact symbioses	Lipid	Patton et al., 1983
			¹⁴ C tracer experiements with ¹⁴ C- acetate : isolated algae and intact symbiosis	Lipid	Patton et al., 1977
			¹⁴ C tracer experiments with ¹⁴ C-	Lipid	Oku et al., 2003
	Anemones	Symbiodinium	¹⁴ C tracer experiments: isolated algae	^d Glycerol, glucose, alanine and organic acids	Trench, 1971 Lewis and Smith, 1971
			¹⁴ C tracer experiments with partial uncoupling of photosyntheis and respiration: intact symbiosis and isolated algae	Glycerol	Battey and Patton, 1987
			Metabolite profiling: intact symbiosis Identification of symbiosis-specific	Glucose, succinate/fumarate Triglyceride	Whitehead and Douglas, 2003 Harland <i>et al.</i> , 1991
			compounds in animal tissue ¹⁴ C tracer studies with ¹⁴ C-acetate:	Lipid	Blanquet et al., 1979
			Metabolism of NaH ¹⁴ CO ₃ , ¹⁴ C-acetate	Glycerol and lipid.	Battay and Patton, 1984
			Metabolism of ¹⁴ C-aspartate and ¹⁴ C-glutamate in aposymbiotic and surphicitic approach	Essential amino acids	Wang and Douglas, 1999
	Zoanthids	Symbiodinium	¹⁴ C tracer experiments: isolated algae	Organic acids, amino acids and sugars	von Holt and Holt, 1968b Lewis and Smith, 1971
	Gorgonians, Jelly-fish and Hydrozoans	Symbiodinium	¹⁴ C tracer experiments: isolated algae using inhibition technique	Glycerol, glucose, alanine	Lewis and Smith, 1971
Fresh water Platyhelminthes	Hydra	Chilorella Tetraselmis	¹⁴ C radiotracer studies: isolated algae ¹⁴ C radiotracer studies: intact symplosis	Maltose Amino acids Particularly alanine	Mews, 1980 Muscatine <i>et al.</i> , 1974 Botyle and Smith, 1975
Mollusca	Tridacnid clams	Symbiodinium	¹⁴ C tracer studies: isolated algae	Glycerol	Muscatine, 1967 Streamer <i>et al.</i> , 1988; Rees <i>et al.</i> 1993
			¹⁴ C tracer studies: intact symbiosis Carbon isotopic [¹³ C] analysis of animal and algal tissue	Glucose 16:0 and 16:1 fatty acids	Ishikura <i>et al.</i> , 1995 Johnston <i>et al.</i> , 1995
Sacoglossan sea slugs		Chloroplasts from food alga	¹⁴ C tracer studies on isolated chlorolasts/homogenized tissue	Glucose, alamine, glycolic acid	Gallop, 1974; Trench et al., 1973
Chordata	Ascidians	Prochloron	¹⁴ C tracer studies impact symbiosis ¹⁴ C tracer on isolated algae	Glucose, galactose, mannose, alanine Glycolate	Trench <i>et al.</i> , 1974 Fisher and Trench, 1980

 Table 2. Photosynthetic products released from photosynthetic symbionts in animals

glucose in the symbiosis but glycerol in isolated algal preparations. The implication that photosynthate release induced by host homogenate may be mechanistically different from that in symbiosis, and consequently artefactual, has led to a renewed interest in the study of photosynthate release in the intact symbiosis.

One approach with considerable potential to study the identity of the mobile compounds of symbiotic algae of animals is metabolite profiling (Whitehead and Douglas, 2003). The rationale of this method is that, over a period of one-to-several min, the animal host metabolizes the mobile compounds to a 'signature' panel of products that is also produced when the animal takes up the same compounds from the exogenous medium. In other words, exogenous compounds that yield the 'signature panel' of animal products are likely to be the mobile compounds. Using this approach, candidate mobile compounds for Symbiodinium in the sea anemone Anemonia viridis have been identified as glucose and the dicarboxylic organic acids succinate and fumarate. As analytical methods for the identification and quantification of metabolites improve, the utility of this method to pinpoint candidate mobile compounds for further investigation will increase.

An important message to emerge from these considerations concerns the experimental approach to study photosynthate release from symbiotic algae. Our understanding of photosynthate release comes principally from research on isolated algae, but insufficient attention has been given to the relevance of the findings to the traits of the algae in symbiosis. Although there is no basis to 'write off' all research with isolated algae as artefact, future research on isolated algal preparations should seek strategies to check the compatibility of results with the interactions in the intact symbiosis.

In comparison to the uncertainty over the mechanisms underlying photosynthate release from symbiotic algae and the identity of the mobile compounds, there is widespread acceptance that photosynthetic products derived from the symbiotic algae are important to the animal host [although even this point is also contested, for example by Goreau (2006)]. Circumstantial evidence includes the apparent absence of alga-free individuals of most animal species capable of forming the symbiosis in natural habitats, and the depressed growth rates of most symbioses incubated in continuous darkness. Classical budget analyses particularly of Muscatine et al. (1984) and Davies (1984) indicate that photosynthetic carbon derived from Symbiodinium is sufficient to meet much or all the total carbon requirement for basal respiration in several coral species. In some coral species, much of the photosynthetic carbon is allocated to mucus, which is produced in copious amounts and is important in feeding and protection from mechanical damage and pathogens. A significant proportion of the photosynthate received by the animal is not, however, dissipated rapidly (Rinkevich, 1989; Tanaka *et al.*, 2006), and this includes photosynthetically-derived carbon in the animal lipid pools (Grotolli *et al.*, 2004), which are crucial for gametogenesis and sexual reproduction in corals and other Cnidaria (Arai *et al.*, 1993).

One important generality embedded in these considerations is that the algae provide the animal with fixed carbon. The animals cannot 'live on' their algal symbionts alone. They obtain nitrogen, phosphorus, and other elements from a combination of dissolved compounds and, for most taxa, holozoic feeding (Schlicter, 1982; Ferrier, 1991; Grover *et al.*, 2006). In this context, the photosynthetic algae have been likened to a source of 'junk food', which meets the immediate energetic demands and other carbon-based requirements of the host, valuable to the animal in environments where other sources of nutrients are in short supply.

The susceptibility of photosynthetic symbioses to environmental stress

Photosynthesis brings to animals major risks as well as nutritional benefits. Photosynthesis can be perturbed by upsetting the balance between the rates of light collection and light use, resulting in the production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) (Asada, 1996). Left unchecked, ROS are damaging to protein function and membrane integrity, and pose a serious threat to both the photosynthetic symbionts and their animal hosts.

Photosynthetic symbioses in animals respond to certain environmental changes by bleaching, literally a loss in colour. Bleaching is caused by the loss of algal pigments or elimination of algal cells from the symbiosis (Brown, 1997). Most research has concerned bleaching in symbioses with Symbiodinium and these symbioses may be particularly susceptible to environmental perturbation. Because Symbiodinium is the usual symbiont of corals, bleaching is often described as 'coral bleaching', but sea anemones, clams and other hosts of Symbiodinium appear to be as susceptible to bleaching as corals. Bleaching can be triggered by multiple factors (Douglas, 2003; Jones, 2004), but most bleaching observed in the field is caused by elevated temperature often acting synergistically with solar radiation (Fitt et al., 2001; Lesser and Farrell, 2004). The impacts of bleaching include reduced growth and reproduction, increased susceptibility to disease and mechanical damage, and occasionally death of the host (Szmant and Gassman, 1990; Glynn, 1996; Baird and Marshall, 2002). Mass bleaching events in recent years has led to the mortality of hosts across entire reefs (Hoegh-Guldberg, 1999).

Photosynthetic corals and other tropical symbioses with *Symbiodinium* live close to their upper thermal tolerance limits (Fitt *et al.*, 2001). On the basis of projected

increases in sea temperature with climate change, mass bleaching events and die-offs have been predicted to increase in frequency and severity over the coming decades (Hoegh-Guldberg, 1999). Indeed, reef collapse has been predicted by the 2020s for the Indian Ocean (Sheppard, 2003) and globally by 2050s (Hoegh-Guldberg, 1999). As corals are the foundation to coral reef ecosystems, coral mortality caused by thermal bleaching is a first-order threat to biodiversity in tropical and subtropical seas.

A large body of evidence now points to the impairment of algal photosynthesis as a key step in the thermal bleaching of Symbiodinium symbioses. Uncertainty, however, still exists over the sequence of events, and several sites have been proposed as the position of the initial lesion in algal photosystems (Fig. 2). Iglesias-Prieto et al. (1992) demonstrated a decrease in the efficiency of Photosystem II (PSII) when cultured algae were exposed to temperatures of 34-36 °C, leading to the suggestion that the primary impact of high temperature was to cause a malfunction in the light reactions of photosynthesis. Warner et al. (1996) recorded a loss of photosynthetic efficiency in algae in bleached corals subjected to elevated temperatures, making a direct link between temperaturedependent impairment of photosynthesis and coral bleaching. Furthermore, the degradation of the reaction centre D1 protein co-occurred with temperature-dependent loss of PSII activity (Warner et al., 1999). The D1 protein has an important structural and functional role in the PSII reaction centre, binding components for charge separation and electron transport. When PSII is excited there is a probability that damage to the D1 protein will occur. Under normal physiological conditions the rate of photodamage does not exceed the capacity to repair the damage, but D1 re-synthesis and replacement may become impaired in algae at elevated temperature, leading to a loss of PSII functional reaction centres (Warner et al., 1999).

An alternative viewpoint is provided by Jones et al. (1998), who argued that damage to PSII was a downstream impact of impairment of the Calvin-Benson Cycle. Specifically, these authors suggest that a decrease in carboxylation of ribulose 1,5 bisphosphate (RuBP) by Rubisco could lead to reduced rates of consumption of products of the photosynthetic electron transport (ATP and NADPH) restricting the rate of flow in the electron transport chain (sink-limitation). These events would result in maximal reduction of the plastoquinone pool, causing damage at PSII through a build-up of excess excitation energy. The net consequence would be the formation of highly reactive triplet states of chlorophyll which react with O_2 to form singlet oxygen $(-O_2^*)$ (Smith et al., 2005). Singlet oxygen is potentially damaging to proteins; it can trigger the degradation of the D1 protein (Asada, 1996) and also react with components in the light-harvesting antennae leading to bleaching of pigments (Halliwell, 1991).

The Mehler reaction is an alternative sink for electrons. It may help prevent maximal reduction of the PSII quinone receptors at the point where the rate of lightdriven transport exceeds the capacity of the temperatureimpaired Calvin cycle (Jones et al., 1998), but at the cost of producing ROS (Asada, 1999). The Mehler reaction involves reduction of O₂ by PSI to produce superoxide radicals that are rapidly converted within the chloroplast to hydrogen peroxide by superoxide dismutase (Fig. 2). Detoxification of hydrogen peroxide to water then occurs by ascorbate peroxidase (Fig. 2). Both superoxide dismutase and ascorbate peroxidase are present in Symbiodinium (Matta and Trench, 1991) and under most conditions the rate of detoxification should exceed the rate of ROS generation. During bleaching, however, ROS could accumulate if the rate of its production exceeds its removal (Smith et al., 2005).

Analysis of variable chlorophyll fluorescence kinetics in Symbiodinium by Tchernov et al. (2004) indicates that elevated temperatures of 32 °C damage thylakoid membranes causing an increase in the rate of electron transport on the acceptor side of PSII with a simultaneous decrease in the maximum quantum yield of photochemistry in the reaction centre. These changes are diagnostic of energetic uncoupling of electron transport, where the transmembrane proton gradient, established by the photochemical reactions in the reaction centres, is dissipated without generating ATP. Thylakoid membranes remain capable of splitting water and photosynthetically-produced O_2 is reduced by the Mehler reaction leading to the accumulation of ROS as described above. Dye tracer experiments conducted by the same authors on algae in culture indicate that the ROS could leak from algal cells (Fig. 2).

Whatever the initial site of damage to algal photosystems, the generation of ROS through temperatureirradiance impairment of photosynthesis presents a source of oxidative stress for the algal and animal partners. Oxidative stress can elicit a wide spectrum of cellular responses (Martindale and Holbrook, 2002), some of which are known to occur in bleaching, for example, exocytosis of algae from host cells (Brown *et al.*, 1995), and lysis of both animal and algal cells by elements of necrotic and programmed cell death pathways (Dunn *et al.*, 2002; Franklin *et al.*, 2004). Little is known about the cellular pathways that mediate cellular responses to oxidative stress in animals with photosynthetic symbionts, although these pathways are well described in model systems (Martindale and Holbrook, 2002).

Recent research of Perez and Weis (2006) on the symbiotic anemone *Aiptasia pallida* provides an indication of the processes involved. Exposure of this symbiosis to heat stress or the photosynthetic inhibitor DCMU



Fig. 2. Three proposed primary impacts of elevated temperature on the photosystems of symbiotic algae in animal hosts, shown as I, II, and III in the figure. (I) Dysfunction of PSII and degradation of the D1 protein. (II) Energetic uncoupling in the thylakoid membranes. (III) Impairment of the Calvin cycle. During bleaching ROS are generated from O_2 via the Mehler reaction and are detoxified by superoxide dismutase (SOD) and ascorbate peroxidase (APX). If the rate of ROS generation exceeds detoxification, then oxidative damage can occur, triggering signalling pathways and cellular responses that underpin bleaching. Singlet oxygen can be generated at damaged PSII reaction centres and in the photosynthetic antennae causing photobleaching of chlorophyll and accessory pigments.

triggers the production of nitric oxide (NO) in the host cell, leading to bleaching of the symbiosis. Incubation of anemones in lipopolysaccharide (LPS) also induces NO in gastrodermal cells of *A. pallida* to similar levels observed with elevated temperature and an inhibitor of phtosystem-II. LPS is known to induce an up-regulation of nitric oxide synthase through the nuclear factor κB (NF- κB)dependent signalling in mammalian systems, and Perez and Weiss (2006) suggest that ROS released from heatstressed photosystems in the algal cells might induce NO production in the host via the similar pathways. They specifically hypothesize that NO converts to cytotoxic peroxynitrite on interaction with superoxide in the host cell, leading to cell death and bleaching.

A number of mechanisms have evolved in the animal hosts that protect the algal photosystems against elevated thermal and light stress. For example, corals can retract soft tissues to reduce light capture (Brown *et al.*, 1994, 2002), and symbiotic sea anemones and corals possess a large diversity of SOD isoforms, similar to those described in terrestrial plants (Richier *et al.*, 2003). Interestingly, corals also possess fluorescent proteins (FPs) which may play a role in ameliorating the impact of high irradiance on algal cells (Salih *et al.*, 2000). The protection offered by FPs is reduced at elevated temperatures however, raising doubts about their photoprotective role during thermal bleaching (Dove, 2004).

Algal–animal symbioses vary greatly in their susceptibility to bleaching and much of this variation has been attributed to differences in thermotolerance among algal partners. Single host species associated with different algal genotypes may vary in bleaching susceptibility (Rowan *et al.*, 1997; Perez *et al.*, 2001). Research on the mechanistic basis of thermal tolerance in the algal cells has focused primarily on non-photochemical quenching (NPQ), which can dissipate excess excitation energy in temperature-impaired algal photosystems (Warner et al., 1996). The xanthophyll cycle is a key NPQ mechanism and it has been described in Symbiodinium (Brown et al., 1999; Venn et al., 2006). Conversion of the pigments diadinoxanthin to diatoxanthin (analogous to the xanthophylls violaxanthin, antheraxanthin, and zeaxanthin in terrestrial plants) diverts excess excitation energy away from PSII reaction centres. Although inhibition of xanthophyll cycling by dithiothreitol (DTT) can lead to increased oxidative damage in corals (Brown et al., 2002), doubts over its significance have been raised by the finding that the abundance and cycling of xanthophyll pigments is not greater in bleaching-resistant than bleaching-susceptible corals (Venn et al., 2006). Other mechanisms of NPQ described in Symbiodinum might contribute to thermal tolerance; they include dissipation of excess excitation energy as heat within the PSII reaction centres (Gorbunov et al., 2001), and state 1 to state 2 transitions associated with phosphorylation and the migration of light- harvesting complexes away from PSII (Hill et al., 2005).

Experiments of Tchernov *et al.* (2004) suggest that lipid saturation determines the stability of the thylakoid membranes at elevated temperature. As the same authors also found evidence that thermal disruption of the thylakoids is the initial site of damage during bleaching, the membrane lipids of symbiotic algae may determine the bleaching susceptibility of animal–algal symbioses. Certain algal genotypes possess thylakoid membranes with a higher content of the mono-unsaturated fatty acid $\Delta 9$ -*cis*-octadecenoic acid (18:1) relative to the major polyunsaturated fatty acid $\Delta 6,9,12,15$ -*cis*-octadecatetraenoic acid (18:4), affording them stability at elevated temperatures.

These findings illustrate a general point: that a variety of processes, from ROS to NO and membrane lipid composition, have all been implicated as determinants of bleaching and variation in susceptibility to bleaching. The task for the future is to establish the relative importance of these different processes and how they interact to mediate the observed bleaching phenomena. This, in turn, will provide a basis for predicting the scale of future bleaching events and their impacts on the coral communities, on which reef ecosystems depend.

Concluding comments

Photosynthesis in animals has been the focus of sustained research for 40–50 years. Despite this, understanding is very limited of both how animals exploit this metabolic capability of their symbiotic algae and how the symbiosis responds to the risks of ROS and photosystem damage. In comparison to other symbioses, notably the rhizobial– legume associations, the photosynthetic symbioses in animals have a major handicap of lacking a genetic 'toolkit' that would enable molecular dissection of the symbiosis based on forward and reverse genetics and gene expression analysis. Some molecular resources are, however, becoming available, notably EST and BAC libraries, with plans for complete genome sequencing, for the algal and animal partners in Symbiodinium-cnidarian symbioses. Furthermore, methods for the genetic transformation of Symbiodinium and RNAi-mediated suppression of host gene expression have been reported (ten Lohuis and Miller, 1997; Dunn et al., 2007), and these deserve sustained investment by the community to promote the development of robust, general protocols for manipulations. These approaches have great potential for identification of genes underpinning the mechanisms by which photosynthesis has been accommodated in animals.

Acknowledgements

The authors acknowledge support from the Khaled Bin Sultan Living Oceans Foundation (AAV), the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (JEL), and The Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (AED) during the preparation of the review.

References

- Allemand D, Furla P, Bénazet-Tambutté S. 1998. Mechanisms of carbon acquisition for endosymbiont photosynthesis in Anthozoa. *Canadian Journal of Botany* 76, 925–941.
- Apelt A, Ax A. 1969. Die Symbiose zwischen dem acoelen turbellar Convoluta convoluta und Diatomeen der Gattung Licmophora. Marine Biology 3, 165–187.
- Arai T, Kato M, Heyward A, Ikeda Y, Iizuka T, Maruyama T. 1993. Lipid composition of positively buoyant eggs of reef building corals. *Coral Reefs* **12**, 71–75.
- Asada K. 1996. Radical production and scavenging in the chloroplast. In: Baker N, ed. *Photosynthesis and the environment*. Dordrecht, Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 123–150.
- Asada K. 1999. The water–water cycle in chloroplasts: scavenging of active oxygens and dissipation of excess photons. *Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology* 50, 601–639.
- **Baird AH, Marshall PA.** 2002. Mortality, growth and reproduction in scleractinian corals following bleaching on the Great Barrier Reef. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **237**, 133–141.
- Baldauf SL. 2003. The deep roots of eukaryotes. *Science* **300**, 1703–1706.
- Banaszak AT, Iglesias-Prieto R, Trench RK. 1993. *Scrippsiella velellae* sp. nov. (Peridiniales) and *Gloeodinium viscum* sp. nov. (Phytodiniales), dinoflagellate symbionts of two Hydrozoans (Cnidaria). *Journal of Phycology* **29**, 517–528.
- **Battey JF, Patton JS.** 1984. A re-evaluation of the role of glycerol in carbon translocation in zooxanthellae–coelenterate symbiosis. *Marine Biology* **79**, 27–38.
- Battey JF, Patton JS. 1987. Glycerol translocation in *Condylactis* gigantea. Marine Biology **95**, 37–46.
- Belda-Baillie CA, Baillie BK, Maruyama T. 2002. Specificity of a model cnidarian–dinoflagellate symbiosis. *Biological Bulletin* 202, 74–85.

- **Blanquet RS, Nevenzel JC, Benson AA.** 1979. Acetate incorporation into the lipids of the anemone *Anthopleura elegantissima* and its associated zooxanthellae. *Marine Biology* **54**, 185–194.
- **Boyle JE, Smith DC.** 1975. Biochemical interactions between the symbionts of *Convoluta roscofensis*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London* B **189**, 121–135.
- Brown BE. 1997. Coral bleaching, causes and consequences. *Coral Reefs* 16, 129–138.
- Brown BE, Ambarsari I, Warner ME, Fitt WK, Dunne RP, Gibb SW, Cummings DG. 1999. Diurnal changes in photochemical efficiency and xanthophyll concentrations in shallow water reef corals: evidence for photoinhibition and photoprotection. *Coral Reefs* 18, 99–105.
- Brown BE, Downs CA, Dunne RP, Gibb S. 2002. Preliminary evidence for tissue retraction as a factor in photoprotection of corals incapable of xanthophyll cycling. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 277, 129–144.
- Brown BE, Dunne RP, Scoffin TP, LeTissier MDA. 1994. Solar damage in intertidal corals. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 103, 219–230.
- Brown BE, LeTissier MDA, Bythell JC. 1995. Mechanisms of bleaching deduced from histological studies of reef corals sampled during a natural bleaching event. *Marine Biology* 122, 655–663.
- Cavalier-Smith T. 2006. Cell evolution and Earth history: stasis and revolution. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society* of London, Series B 361, 969–1006.
- Cernichiari E, Muscatine L, Smith DC. 1969. Maltose excretion by symbiotic algae of *Hydra viridis*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B* **173**, 557–567.
- **Davies PS.** 1984. The role of zooxanthellae in the nutritional energy requirements of *Pocillopora eydouxi*. *Coral Reefs* **2**, 181–186.
- Day RJ. 1994. Algal symbiosis in *Bunodeopsis*: sea anemones with auxiliary structures. *Biological Bulletin* 186, 182–194.
- **Douglas AE.** 1987. Experimental studies on symbiotic *Chlorella* in the neorhabdocoel turbellaria *Dalyellia viridis and Typhloplana viridata*. *British Phycological Journal* **22**, 157–161.
- **Douglas AE.** 2003. Coral bleaching: how and why? *Marine Pollution Bulletin* **46**, 385–392.
- **Dove S.** 2004. Scleractinian corals with photoprotective host pigments are hypersensitive to thermal bleaching. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **272**, 99–116.
- Dunn S, Bythell J, Le Tissier M, Burnett W, Thomason J. 2002. Programmed cell death and cell necrosis activity during hyperthermic stress-induced bleaching of the symbiotic sea anemone *Aiptasia* sp. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 272, 29–53.
- **Dunn SR, Phillips WS, Weis VM.** 2007. Knockdown of actin and caspase gene expression by RNA interference in the symbiotic sea anemone *Aiptasia pallida*. *Biological Bulletin* (in press).
- Elliott J, Cook CB. 1989. Diel variation in prey capture behaviour by the corallimorpharian *Discosoma sanctithomae*: mechanical and chemical activation of feeding. *Biological Bulletin* **176**, 218–228.
- Ferrier MD. 1991. Net uptake of dissolved free amino acids by four scleractinian corals. *Coral Reefs* **10**, 183–187.
- Fischer A, Meindl D, Loos E. 1989. Glucose excretion by the symbiotic Chlorella of Spongilla fluviatilis. Planta 179, 251–256.
- Fisher CR, Trench RK. 1980. In vitro carbon fixation by Prochloron sp. isolated from Diplosoma virens. Biological Bulletin 159, 639–648.
- Fitt WK, Brown BE, Warner ME, Dunne RP. 2001. Coral bleaching: interpretation of thermal tolerance limits and thermal thresholds in tropical corals. *Coral Reefs* **20**, 51–65.

- Franklin DJ, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Jones RJ, Berges JA. 2004. Cell death and degeneration in the symbiotic dinoflagellates of the coral *Stylophora pistillata* during bleaching. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 272, 117–130.
- **Gallop A.** 1974. Evidence for the presence of a 'factor' in *Elysia viridis* which stimulates photosynthate release from its symbiotic chloroplasts. *New Phytologist* **73**, 1111–1117.
- Gates RD, Hoegh-Guldberg O, McFallNgai MJ, Bil KY, Muscatine L. 1995. Free amino acids exhibit anthozoan host factor activity: they induce the release of photosynthate from symbiotic dinoflagellates *in vitro*. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* **92**, 7430–7434.
- Gattuso JP, Jaubert J. 1990. Effect of light on oxygen and carbon dioxide fluxes and on metabolic quotients measured *in situ* in a zooxanthellate coral. *Limnology and Oceanography* 35, 1796–1804.
- **Glynn P.** 1996. Coral reef bleaching:facts, hypotheses and implications. *Global Change Biology* **2**, 495–509.
- **Gorbunov MY, Kolber ZS, Lesser MP, Falkowski PG.** 2001. Photosynthesis and photoprotection in symbiotic corals. *Limnology and Oceanography* **46**, 75–85.
- **Goreau T.** 2006. Coral Health and Monitoring Program (CHAMP) email list, archives. http://coral.aoml.noaa.gov/pipermail/corallist/2006-May/003284.html.
- **Grant AJ, Rémond M, People J, Hinde R.** 1997. Effects of hosttissue homogenate of the scleractinian coral *Plesiastrea versipora* on glycerol metabolism in isolated symbiotic dinoflagellates. *Marine Biology* **128**, 665–670.
- Grant AJ, Trautman DA, Menz I, Hinde R. 2006. Separation of two cell signalling molecules from a symbiotic sponge that modify algal carbon metabolism. *Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications* 348, 92–98.
- **Grottoli AG, Rodrigues LJ, Juarez C.** 2004. Lipids and stable carbon isotopes in two species of Hawaiian corals, Porites compressa and Montipora verrucosa, following a bleaching event. *Marine Biology* **145**, 621–631.
- Grover R, Maguer J-F, Allemand D, Ferrier-Pagès C. 2006. Urea uptake by the scleractinian coral *Stylophora pistillata*. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 332, 216–225.
- Halliwell B. 1991. Oxygen radicals: their formation in plant tissues and their role in herbicide damage. In: Baker N, Percival M, eds. *Herbicides*. Amsterdam: Elsevier Science Publishers, 87–129.
- Harland AD, Fixter LM, Davies PS, Anderson RA. 1991. Distribution of lipids between the zooxanthellae and animal compartment in the symbiotic sea-anemone *Anemonia viridis*: wax esters, triglycerides and fatty-acids. *Marine Biology* **110**, 13–19.
- Hill R, Frankart C, Ralph PJ. 2005. Impact of bleaching conditions on the components of non-photochemical quenching in the zooxanthellae of a coral. *Journal of Marine Biology and Ecology* **322**, 83–92.
- Hinde R. 1988. Factors produced by symbiotic marine invertebrates which affect translocation between the symbionts. In: Scannerini S, Smith D, Bonfante-Fasolo P, Gianninazzi-Pearson V, eds. *Cell to cell signals in plant, animal and microbial symbiosis.* Berlin and Heidelberg, Germany: Springer-Verlag, 311–324.
- Hoegh-Guldberg O. 1999. Climate change, coral beaching and the future of the world's coral reefs. *Marine and Freshwater Research* 50, 839–866.
- Iglesias-Prieto RJL, Matta WA, Robins WA, Trench RK. 1992. Photosynthetic response to elevated temperature in the symbiotic dinoflagellate Symbiodinium microadriaticum in culture. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 89, 10302–10305.
- Ishikura M, Adachi K, Maruyama T. 1999. Zooxanthellae release glucose in the tissue of a giant clam, *Tridacna crocea*. *Marine Biology* **133**, 665–673.

- Johnston M, Yellowlees D, Gilmour I. 1995. Carbon isotopic analysis of the free fatty acids in a tridacnid-algal symbiosis: interpretation and implications for the symbiotic association. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B* **260**, 293–297.
- Jones R. 2004. Testing the 'photoinhibition' model of coral bleaching using chemical inhibitors. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 284, 133–145.
- Jones R, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Larkum AWL, Schreiber U. 1998. Temperature induced bleaching of corals begins with impairment of dark metabolism in zooxanthellae. *Plant, Cell and Environment* 21, 1219–1230.
- Lee YK, Lee JH, Lee HK. 2001. Microbial symbiosis in marine sponges. *Journal of Microbiology* **39**, 254–264.
- **Lesser M, Farrell J.** 2004. Exposure to solar radiation increases damage to both host tissues and algal symbionts of coral during thermal stress. *Coral Reefs* **23**, 367–377.
- **Lewin RA, Cheng L.** 1989. *Prochloron: a microbial enigma*. New York: Chapman and Hall.
- Lewis DH, Smith DC. 1971. The autotrophic nutrition of symbiotic marine coelenterates with special reference to hermatypic corals. I. Movement of photosynthetic products between the symbionts. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B* **178**, 111–129.
- ten Lohuis MR, Miller DJ. 1998. Genetic transformation of dinoflagellates (*Amphidinium* and *Symbiodinium*): expression of GUS in microalgae using heterologous promoter constructs. *The Plant Journal* 13, 427–435.
- Martindale J, Holbrook N. 2002. Cellular response to oxidative stress: signaling for suicide and survival. *Journal of Cellular Physiology* **192**, 1–15.
- Matta J, Trench R. 1991. The enzymatic response of the symbiotic dinoflagellate *Symbiodinium microadriaticum* (Freudenthal) to growth *in vitro* under varied oxygen tensions. *Symbiosis* **11**, 31–45.
- **Mews LK.** 1980. The green hydra symbiosis. III. The biotrophic transport of carbohydrate from algato animal. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B* **209**, 377–401.
- **Muscatine L.** 1967. Glycerol excretion by symbiotic algae from corals and tridacna and its control by the host. *Science* **156**, 516–519.
- Muscatine L, Boyle JE, Smith DC. 1974. Symbiosis of the acoel flatworm *Convoluta roscoffensis* with the alga *Platymonas convolutae*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series* B 187, 221–224.
- Muscatine L, Falkowski PG, Porter JW, Dubinsky Z. 1984. Fate of photosynthetic fixed carbon in light-adapted and shadeadapted colonies of the symbiotic coral *Stylophora pistillata*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B* 222, 181–202.
- Norton JH, Shepherd MA, Long HM, Fitt WK. 1992. Zooxanthellal tubular system in the giant clam. *Biological Bulletin* **183**, 503–506.
- **Oku H, Yamashiro H, Onaga K.** 2003. Lipid biosynthesis from [¹⁴C]-glucose in the coral *Montipora digitata*. *Fisheries Science* **69**, 625–631.
- Papina M, Meziane T, van Woesik R. 2003. Symbiotic zooxanthellae provide the host-coral *Montipora digitata* with polyunsaturated fatty acids. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology B* 135, 533–537.
- Parke M, Manton I. 1967. Specific identity of algal symbiont in Convoluta roscoffensis. Journal of the Marine Biological Association UK 47, 445–457.
- Patton JS, Abraham S, Benson AA. 1977. Lipogenesis in the intact coral *Pocillopora capitata* and its isolated zooxanthellae, evidence for a light-driven carbon cycle between symbiont and host. *Marine Biology* 44, 235–247.

- Patton JS, Battey JF, Rigler MW, Porter JW, Black CC, Burris JE. 1983. A comparison of the metabolism of bicarbonate C⁻¹⁴ and acetate 1-C⁻¹⁴ and the variability of species lipid compositions in reef corals. *Marine Biology* **75**, 121–130.
- Perez SF, Cook CB, Brooks WR. 2001. The role of symbiotic dinoflagellates in the temperature-induced bleaching response of the subtropical sea anemone *Aiptasia pallida*. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 256, 1–14.
- Perez S, Weis V. 2006. Nitric oxide and cnidarian bleaching: an eviction notice mediates breakdown of a symbiosis. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 209, 2804–2810.
- Rands ML, Douglas AE, Loughman BC, Hawes CR. 1992. The pH of the perisymbiont space in the green hydra–*Chlorella* symbiosis: an immunocytochemical investigation. *Protoplasma* **170**, 90–93.
- Rees TAV, Fitt WK, Baillie B, Yellowlees D. 1993. A method for temporal measurement of haemolymph composition in the giant clam symbiosis and its application to glucose and glycerol levels during diel cycle. *Limnology and Oceanography* 38, 213–217.
- Richier S, Merle P, Furla P, Pigozzi D, Sola F, Allemand D. 2003. Characterization of superoxide dismutases in anoxia and hyperoxia- tolerant symbiotic cnidarians. *Biochimica et Biophysica Acta* **1621**, 84–91.
- Rinkevich B. 1989. The contribution of photosynthetic products to coral reproduction. *Marine Biology* 101, 259–263.
- Ritchie RJ, Grant AJ, Eltringham K, Hinde R. 1997. Clotrimazole, a model compound for the host release factor of the coral *Plesiastrea versipora* (Lamarck). *Australian Journal of Plant Physiology* 24, 283–290.
- Rowan R, Knowlton N, Baker AC, Jara J. 1997. Landscape ecology of algal symbionts creates variation in episodes of coral bleaching. *Nature* **388**, 265–269.
- Salih A, Larkum A, Cox G, Kuhl M, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2000. Fluorescent pigments in corals are photoprotective. *Nature* **408**, 850–853.
- Schlieter D. 1982. Nutritional strategies of cnidarians: the absorption, translocation and utilization of dissolved nutrients by *Heteroxenia fuscescens. American Zoologist* 22, 659–669.
- Sheppard CRC. 2003. Predicted recurrences of mass coral mortality in the Indian Ocean. *Nature* 425, 294–297.
- **Shick JM.** 1991. *The functional biology of sea anemones*. London: Chapman and Hall.
- Smith DJ, Suggett DJ, Baker N. 2005. Is photoinhibition of zooxanthellae photosynthesis the primary cause of thermal bleaching in corals? *Global Change Biology* **11**, 1–11.
- Stat M, Carter D, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2006. The evolutionary history of *Symbiodinium* and scleractinian hosts: symbiosis, diversity, and the effect of climate change. *Perspectives in Plant Ecology Evolution and Systematics* 8, 23–43.
- Streamer M, Griffiths DJ, Thinh LV. 1988. The products of photosynthesis by zooxanthellae (*Symbiodinium microadriaticum*) of *Tridacna gigas* and their transfer to the host. *Symbiosis* 6, 237–252.
- Sutton DC, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 1990. Host–zooxanthella interactions in 4 temperate marine invertebrate symbioses: assessment of effect of host extracts on symbionts. *Biological Bulletin* 178, 175–186.
- Szmant AM, Gassman NJ. 1990. The effects of prolonged 'bleaching' on the tissue biomass and reproduction of the reef coral *Montastrea annularis*. *Coral Reefs* 8, 217–224.
- Tanaka Y, Miyajima T, Koike I, Hayashibara T, Ogawa H. 2006. Translocation and conservation of organic nitrogen within the coral–zooxanthella symbiotic system of *Acropora pulchra*, as

12 of 12 Venn et al.

demonstrated by dual isotope-labeling techniques. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* **336**, 110–119.

- Tchernov D, Gorbunov MY, Vargas CD, Yadav SN, Milligan AJ, Haggblom M, Falkowsi PG. 2004. Membrane lipids of symbiotic algae are diagnostic of sensitivity to thermal bleaching in corals. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 101, 13531–13535.
- **Trench RK.** 1971. The physiology and biochemistry of zooxanthellae symbiotic with marine coelenterates. III. The effects of homogenates of host tissues on the excretion of photosynthetic products *in vitro* by zooxanthellae from marine coelenterates. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London ,Series B* **177**, 251–264.
- Trench RK. 1979. The cell biology of plant-animal symbiosis. Annual Review of Plant Physiology **30**, 484–531.
- Trench RK, Boyle JE, Smith DC. 1973. The association between chloroplasts of *Codium fragile* and the mollusc *Elysia viridis*. I. Characteristics of isolated *Codium* chloroplasts. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B* 184, 51–61.
- Trench RK, Boyle JE, Smith DC. 1974. The association between chloroplasts of *Codium fragile* and the mollusc *Elysia viridis*. III. Movement of photosynthetically fixed Carbon 14 in tissues of intact living *E. viridis* and in *Tridachia crispata*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B* 185, 453–464.
- Venn AA, Wilson MA, Trapido-Rosenthal HG, Keely BJ, Douglas AE. 2006. The impact of coral bleaching on the pigment profile of the symbiotic alga, *Symbiodinium*. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **29**, 2133–2142.
- von Holt C, von Holt M. 1968. The secretion of organic compounds by zooxanthellae isolated from various types of Zoanthus. Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology 24, 82–93.
- Wang J-T, Douglas AE. 1997. Nutrients, signals and photosynthate release by symbiotic algae: the impact of taurine on the

dinoflagellate alga *Symbiodinium* from the sea anemone *Aiptasia* pulchella. Journal of Plant Physiology **114**, 631–636.

- Wang J-T, Douglas AE. 1998. Nitrogen recycling or nitrogen conservation in an alga–invertebrate symbiosis? *Journal of Experimental Biology* 201, 2445–2453.
- Wang JT, Douglas AE. 1999. Essential amino acid synthesis and nitrogen recycling in an alga–invertebrate symbiosis. *Marine Biology* 135, 219–222.
- Warner ME, Fitt WK, Scmidt GW. 1996. The effects of elevated temperature on the photosynthetic efficiency of zooxanthellae *in hospite* from four different species of reef coral: a novel approach. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **19**, 291–299.
- Warner ME, Fitt WK, Scmidt GW. 1999. Damage to photosystem II in symbiotic dinoflagellates: a determinant of coral bleaching. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, USA 96, 8007–8012.
- Whitehead LF, Douglas AE. 2003. Metabolite comparisons and the identity of nutrients translocated from symbiotic algae to an animal host. *Journal of Experimental Biology* **206**, 3149–3157.
- Wilkinson CR. 1979. Nutrient translocation from symbiotic cyanobacteria to coral reef sponges. In: Lvi C, Boury-Esnault N, eds. *Biologie des spongiaires*. Paris, France: Coll. internat.CNRS, 373–380.
- Wilkinson CR. 1980. Nutrient translocation from green algal symbionts to the freshwater sponge *Ephydatia fluviatilis*. *Hydrobiologia* **75**, 241–250.
- Wilkinson C. 2004. *Status of coral reefs of the world*, Vol. 2. Townsville: Australian Institute of Marine Science.
- Wilkinson C, Linden O, Cesar H, Hodgson G, Rubens J, Strong AE. 1990. Ecological and socioeconomic impacts of 1998 coral mortality in the Indian Ocean: An ENSO impact and a warning of future change? *Ambio* 28, 188–196.